

# ***NETL's Office of Fossil Energy***

January 29-30, 2002

## **Roadmap Update for Natural Gas Infrastructure Reliability**



**Sponsored by:**



*U.S. Department of Energy  
National Energy Technology Laboratory*



---

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0	SECURITY AND ENERGY ASSURANCE .....	1
2.0	R&D GROUP .....	6
3.0	INTERDEPENDENCIES, MODELING AND INTEGRATION.....	14

---

SECTION **1.0**

**SECURITY AND ENERGY ASSURANCE**

---

**Participants:  
Security and Energy Assurance**

**NAME**

**ORGANIZATION**

**FACILITATOR:**

## Security and Energy Assurance

**TABLE 1-1. BARRIERS**

◆ = TOP PRIORITY

PHYSICAL PLANT: MONITORING & LIMITATIONS	DETECTION: UNDERGROUND FACILITIES & LEAKS	OUTSIDE FORCE DAMAGE (INCLUDING THIRD-PARTY)	DATA ACQUISITION & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY	SYSTEM MONITORING, ANALYSIS & CONTROL	REGULATORY & INSTITUTIONAL	CONSTRUCTION, MAINTENANCE & REPAIR	SECURING THE INFRASTRUCTURE	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Material limits on T&amp;D</li><li>• Monitoring of physical plant condition</li><li>• Inadequate tools to evaluate pipeline integrity ♦♦</li><li>• Lack of predictive pipe–failure models</li><li>• Need better pipeline inspection tools—internal and external ♦♦♦♦♦</li><li>• Get back to operating at design capacity ♦</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Lack of technician to locate and identify facilities</li><li>• Rapid leak detection needed—remove, non-intrusive</li><li>• Ability to locate non-metallic pipe</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Warning of third-party intrusion ♦♦♦♦♦♦♦♦</li><li>• Real-time damage detection ♦♦♦♦</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Converting data, real-time tools</li><li>• Lack of sensors for dynamic applications</li><li>• Lack of automated information/data management</li><li>• Ability to handle complex information during emergency</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Lack of understanding of transient flow and impacts</li><li>• Lack of real-time consumption information</li><li>• Systems to respond to, variable delivery cycles</li><li>• Improving overall efficiency of pipeline and compressors ♦♦♦♦</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Limitations on operating pressures</li><li>• Common basis for technical evaluation and certification</li><li>• Permitting process</li><li>• Limited dollars for technical improvement ♦♦</li><li>• Environmental concerns ♦♦</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Better guided boring technologies</li><li>• Ability to excavate quickly without damage to underground utilities ♦♦♦♦♦</li><li>• Need low - cost pipeline rehab/retrofit technology ♦</li><li>• Lack of intelligent, trenchless technology</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Threat and vulnerability assessments needed ♦♦♦♦♦♦♦♦</li><li>• Security/ classification of information ♦</li><li>• Lack of industry standards for secure information and protocol communication ♦♦♦♦♦♦♦♦</li><li>• No hardened secure communication technologies ♦♦♦♦♦</li><li>• New level of complexity, information sharing and control</li><li>• New organizational ties need to be established</li><li>• Large, diffuse infrastructure: remote ♦♦♦♦♦♦♦♦</li><li>• Accessibility of facilities (compressor stations, need quick response ♦♦♦♦♦♦♦♦</li><li>• Exposure of above ground pipes ♦♦♦♦♦♦♦♦</li><li>• Moving gas to areas of greatest need after emergency</li><li>• Identify responsibilities and liability of problems ♦♦</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• New funding question: Who pays? ♦♦</li><li>• Response to security needs with financial and manpower constraints ♦♦♦♦</li><li>• Different assurance objectives at work</li><li>• Need for fuel flexibility at end-use for more robust system ♦</li><li>• Operational efficiencies among infrastructure (H<sub>2</sub>O, electric, etc.)</li><li>• Balancing need to investigate versus getting back on line</li><li>• Educating the public ♦♦♦♦<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>– instructions</li><li>– emergency resource</li><li>– damage control</li></ul></li><li>• Need an active system to respond/prevent ♦♦</li><li>• Emergency responder training and protocol</li><li>• Controlling internal threats (within companies)</li><li>• Voluntary versus required mutual assistance</li></ul>

## Security and Energy Assurance

**TABLE 1-2. OPPORTUNITIES**

◆ = TOP PRIORITY

THIRD PARTY DAMAGE	COMPRESSORS	MATERIALS	EDUCATION & TRAINING	FUNDING ISSUES	PIPELINE EFFICIENCY
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Right-of-way monitoring ◆◆◆◆◆◆◆◆◆◆                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Satellite imaging</li> </ul> </li> <li>Real-time detection</li> <li>Warning 3rd party intrusion equipment and software needed, user-friendly GPS</li> <li>Soft dig excavator ◆◆◆</li> <li>Minimize 3rd party damage with improved GPS data</li> <li>Rehab technology to reduce likelihood of failure from 3rd party damage ◆◆</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Retrofit technology to widen operational range of computer equipment</li> <li>Retrofit technology to reduce fuel cost ◆</li> <li>Retrofit technology to uprate existing horsepower ◆</li> <li>Retrofit technology to meet more stringent environmental requirements ◆◆</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Plastics technology, self-healing ◆</li> <li>Retrofit ballistic armor pipe covering for above-ground piping protection ◆</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Internet-based network for online training</li> <li>Educational tools, methods and training for dissemination to the public</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Joint industry-regulatory work group to explore funding issues ◆</li> <li>Funding—possible clearing house of any government funds available</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Cost-effective methods ??? ??? efficiency</li> </ul>
SECURITY	UNDERGROUND DETECTION	BORING	INSPECTION	AUTOMATION	REPAIR
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Infrastructure location classification system ◆◆◆</li> <li>Pipeline “force-field” with tie-ins for crews ◆◆◆</li> <li>Perimeter (fence), motion detection (economic) ◆◆◆</li> <li>Develop low -cost application other end-use controls that operate under broader range of gas supply characteristics</li> <li>Conduct vulnerability assessment for N.G. system ◆◆◆◆                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Educate the industry on VA results</li> </ul> </li> <li>Autonomous isolated facility stand-alone security system ◆◆</li> <li>National Emergency Warning System ◆◆◆◆◆◆◆◆◆◆</li> <li>Sharing of imagery, DOD satellites</li> <li>Standard communication method that flows from governmental agencies to field ◆◆◆◆◆◆</li> <li>Secure SCADA systems                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Standards for secure communication</li> <li>Hardware and software encryption (transfer)</li> </ul> </li> <li>test facility to confirm (Ross mfr comm. capability)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Acoustic device for leak detection and 3rd party hits ◆◆◆</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Boring equipment with real-time damage detection ◆◆◆◆</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inspection tools for ??? mains ◆◆◆◆◆◆                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Self-propelled internal inspection tool</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop industry standards (non-proprietary) for controls and communication equipment ◆◆◆</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop construction excavation equipment for low cost street trenching, moves fast, minimizes mess ◆</li> <li>Rapid micro/keyhole excavation tools for external corrosion DA validation</li> </ul>

**Security and Energy Assurance**  
**TABLE 1-3. IMPLEMENTATION PLANS**

	CHARACTERISTICS & REQUIREMENTS	R&D ELEMENTS	CRITICAL STEPS	COLLABORATIONS	SCHEDULE & MONEY
<b>RIGHT-OF WAY MONITORING/THIRD PARTY DAMAGE PREVENTION</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Third-party damage control mechanisms</li> <li>• Accurate GIS map with automatic (instant) update</li> <li>• Reliable, no false positives</li> <li>• Devices that alert people from unintentional intrusion</li> <li>• Real-time information</li> <li>• Discern normal activity versus abnormal activity</li> <li>• One-call system with monitoring activation</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Early warning of intrusion to company/"outsider"</li> <li>• Communication mechanisms, secure</li> <li>• Intrusion prevention devices ("turn off a backhoe), device that feeds to GPS</li> <li>• Use fiber optics to integrate with detection system <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Sensing devices that discriminate</li> <li>– acoustic</li> <li>– satellite imaging</li> <li>– invisible</li> </ul> </li> <li>• "Fields" around buried pipes, radio signals around metal pipe <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– retrofit for existing pipe</li> <li>– new construction</li> <li>– tracer wires for plastic pipes</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sound GPS/GIS system</li> <li>• Sound business case</li> <li>• Integrate with partners; spread risk/cost/responsibility <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– ideal but hard to obtain</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Easy, quick and cheap to implement (sensors, comm, er), use existing facilities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Common ground alliance</li> <li>• Pipeline companies</li> <li>• LOCs</li> <li>• Regulators</li> <li>• OEM/manufacturer/suppliers</li> <li>• One call organization</li> <li>• Researchers</li> <li>• Federal government research money</li> <li>• Satellites</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• For/use alliances with other infrastructure</li> <li>• Identify most critical element <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– common ground alliance</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Five- to ten-year time frame</li> </ul>
<b>SECURE SCADA SYSTEMS</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Impervious to outside attack, no hackers</li> <li>• Perform current functions with no degradation</li> <li>• Applicable to existing hardware</li> <li>• Self-checking system, smart</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agree upon industry consensus standard</li> <li>• Easily, automatic, low - cost updating of software</li> <li>• Testing and certification facility for ensuring interoperability of manufacturing equipment</li> <li>• Encryption algorithms and software development</li> <li>• Expert analysis of secure system</li> <li>• More sophisticated cyber monitoring and screening <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– wireless systems are not secure</li> <li>– hacker test facility</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Security vulnerability assessment</li> <li>• Agree on common standard</li> <li>• Examine how to leverage off of existing technologies</li> <li>• Resolving national and private interests</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• SCADA and process control equipment vendors</li> <li>• Software engineers, various fields</li> <li>• Security experts (government, contractors, etc.)</li> <li>• Common ground alliance/other infrastructures</li> <li>• National issues—DOE, industry trade organizations</li> <li>• Federal government industry cooperation needed with money</li> </ul>	

**Security and Energy Assurance**  
**TABLE 1-3. IMPLEMENTATION PLANS (CON'T)**

	CHARACTERISTICS & REQUIREMENTS	R&D ELEMENTS	CRITICAL STEPS	COLLABORATIONS	SCHEDULE & MONEY
<b>GOVERNMENT ROLE</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Government facilitated demonstrations               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– industry state-of-the-art</li> <li>– crossover and ??? from other industries</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Government test bed facility</li> <li>• Showcase technology</li> <li>• Test new devices</li> <li>• Physical security of critical facilities               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– compressors</li> <li>– above-ground facilities (valves)</li> <li>– storage</li> <li>– meters</li> <li>– above-line valves</li> </ul> </li> </ul>				

---

---

SECTION **2.0**  
**R&D GROUP**

---

---

**Participants:  
R&D Group**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>ORGANIZATION</b>
Bob Bass	SWRI
Dan Driscoll	DOE/NETL
Paul Gustilo	AGA
Dave Johnson	Enron
Abraham Knuk	NRCan
Shreekant Malvadkar	DOE/NETL
Graham Midgley	Heath Cons.
Bob Moody	CMS Energy
Randy Moss	So. Cross
Bruce Nestleroth	Battelle
Jerry Paulus	City of MESA Gas
George Ragula	PSE&G
Christina Sames	OPS
Crystal Sharp	DOE/NETL
Wes Soyster	Equitable Gas
Andy Theodos	TCO
Bob Torbin	Foster Miller

**FACILITATOR:** ALICIA DALTON, ENERGETICS, INCORPORATED



**R&D Group**  
**TABLE 2-1. WHAT ARE THE TECHNOLOGY ISSUES AND BARRIERS?**

PHYSICAL PLANT: MONITORING AND LIMITATIONS	DETECTION : UNDERGROUND FACILITIES AND LEAKS	SYSTEM MONITORING, ANALYSIS AND CONTROL	OUTSIDE FORCE DAMAGE (INCLUDING 3 <sup>RD</sup> PARTY)		REGULATORY AND INSTITUTIONAL	REGULATORY AND INSTITUTIONAL (CONTINUED)	CONSTRUCTION, MAINTENANCE, AND REPAIR	SECURITY
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Material limits on Transmission and Distribution</li> <li>Monitoring of physical plant condition</li> <li>Inadequate tools to evaluate pipeline integrity <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Only 30% of all pipeline are able to be inspected</li> </ul> </li> <li>Need better pipeline inspection tools – internal and external</li> <li>Lack of predictive pipe-failure models</li> <li>Need for improved compression technologies</li> <li>No long-term view from purchasing decision makers</li> <li>Integrity assessment of unpiggable transmission mains</li> <li>Current accurate map information</li> <li>Lack of large diameter/high pressure CCTV inspection “Live”</li> <li>Lack of non-destructive testing for PE joints</li> <li>Redefine pigging practice</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of technology to locate and identify facilities</li> <li>Rapid leak detection needed-remote, non-intrusive</li> <li>Ability to locate non-metallic pipe</li> <li>Lack of cast iron pipe joint locators</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of understanding of transient flow and impacts</li> <li>Lack of real time consumption information</li> <li>Systems to respond to variable delivery cycles</li> <li>Need more system optimization R&amp;D</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Warning of 3<sup>rd</sup> party intrusion <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Intentional</li> <li>Accidental</li> </ul> </li> <li>Real-time damage detection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Converting data → real-time tools</li> <li>Lack of sensors for dynamic applications</li> <li>Lack of automated information data management</li> <li>Advanced interpretations of close-interval survey data</li> <li>Data fusion <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Format</li> <li>Hardware</li> <li>Software</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Limitations on operating pressures</li> <li>Common basis for technology evaluation and certification</li> <li>Permitting process</li> <li>Limited dollars for technology improvement</li> <li>Clean Air Act impact on HP (new and existing compressor stations)</li> <li>Technology adoption inhibited by combination of regulatory and technology transfer issues</li> <li>Localized focus vs. industry focus</li> <li>Decrease in qualified personnel (technical</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of long term funding/vision/commitment</li> <li>R&amp;D and new materials should be exempt from regulatory Restrictions</li> <li>Lack of cooperation, communication and data sharing among pipelines, LDCs, electric, etc.</li> <li>Personnel change – never work with same people twice</li> <li>Typically have non-technical people writing technical mandates</li> <li>Lack of idea forums to fully develop ideas</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Need low -cost pipeline rehab/retrofit technology</li> <li>Better guided boring technologies</li> <li>Ability to excavate quickly without damage to underground utilities</li> <li>Lack of intelligent trenchless technology</li> <li>Need for recon/ surveillance technologies</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Rapid recovery plans for key facilities</li> <li>Real time detection and assessment of adversarial intruders to gate settings/ meters at first barriers</li> <li>Real time detection and assessment of intruders to compressor stations at first barriers</li> </ul>

**R&D Group**  
**TABLE 2-2. What Are the R&D OPPORTUNITIES TO MEET THE NEEDS?**  
 ♦ = TOP PRIORITY

INSTALLATION	3 <sup>RD</sup> PARTY DAMAGE	REGULATORY AND INSTITUTIONAL	UTILIZATION	INSPECTION	REPAIR	MODELING	SECURITY
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Develop sonic excavation tools using harmonics ♦</li> <li>• Develop programs to enhance trenchless technologies ♦♦</li> <li>• Construction methods and technology to minimize installation and/or repair</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Combine satellite right of way surveillance with fiber optic cable vibration ♦♦</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Better communication between industry sectors – joint action –gas, electric, transmission, distribution</li> <li>• Split research from development</li> <li>• Develop a standard for mapping ♦♦♦</li> <li>• Utilize military technology (military contractors) for industrial/public benefit ♦</li> <li>• Combine government and industrial R&amp;D efforts/management ♦♦♦♦♦               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Allow industry development of ideas and feedback during R&amp;D activities (better communications)</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Natural gas reformer development to reduce air pollution and efficiency ♦</li> <li>• Add molecule to natural gas to make inert then remove to make flammable ♦</li> <li>• Commercial, residential storage systems ♦♦</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Develop magnetic flux leverage (MFL) tools for better pit geometry ♦♦♦</li> <li>• Smaller robotic distribution technologies move through pipelines report anomalies ♦♦</li> <li>• Through transmission inspection: transmitter inside sensor outside ♦♦</li> <li>• Sensors for inspection crawlers ♦♦</li> <li>• Advanced robotic technology for non-piggable mains (transmission) ♦♦♦♦♦♦♦♦</li> <li>• Fast response sensor technology ♦</li> <li>• Inspection pig detecting changes (dents, corrosion, coating)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Robotic repair of internal corrosion ♦♦♦♦♦</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Develop advanced algorithms to maximize information from existing inspection data ♦</li> <li>• Infrastructure optimization to improve reliability. Examine all pipelines. Connect logical pipelines via headers               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– North to South</li> <li>– East and West</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Develop suite of cost-effective surveillance techniques ♦♦♦♦♦               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Develop satellite images for continuous patrol/survey</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Develop standards for security assessments and methods</li> <li>• Put up a force field ♦♦</li> <li>• Develop DOD-type intelligence to help guide pipelines above ground</li> </ul>

**R&D Group**  
**TABLE 2-2. WHAT ARE THE R&D OPPORTUNITIES TO MEET THE NEEDS? (con't)**  
 ♦ = TOP PRIORITY

AUTOMATION	MATERIALS	COMPRESSORS	LEAK DETECTION	UNDERGROUND DETECTION
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• High speed wireless communication technology ♦</li> <li>• System optimization               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Models</li> <li>– Sensors/controls</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Sensor/instrument ♦               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Gas quality</li> <li>– Meters</li> <li>– DE/TVDT</li> <li>– Security</li> <li>– Pipes</li> <li>– Machines</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Coating for PE pipe to reduce installation cost</li> <li>• Non-corroding high pressure piping materials</li> <li>• Materials R&amp;D               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– New pipes</li> <li>– Making reliability</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Synergies - compression technologies, deliverability, reliability, efficiency, emissions ♦♦               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Existing equipment</li> <li>– New novel techniques</li> <li>– Monitoring controls</li> </ul> </li> <li>• New engine technologies countered opposed piston design ♦</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Develop laser technology to leak survey lines above ground ♦♦♦♦</li> <li>• Visual leak detection using infrared imaging ♦♦♦</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Retrofit device to make PE pipe locatable with current technology ♦♦</li> </ul>

**R&D Group**  
**TABLE 2-3. PORTFOLIO GAP ANALYSIS**  
 ♦ = TOP PRIORITY

PARTIALLY IN THE PORTFOLIO						
3 <sup>RD</sup> PARTY DAMAGE	INSTALLATION	SECURITY	LEAK DETECTION	INSPECTION		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Combine satellite right of way surveillance with fiber optic cable vibration ◆◆◆</li><li>– Satellite to assess what's being detected</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Develop programs to enhance trenchless technology ◆◆◆◆◆<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>– Elimination of all penetration</li></ul></li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Develop suite of cost effective surveillance techniques ◆◆◆<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>– Develop satellite images for continuous patrol/survey</li></ul></li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Develop laser technology to leak survey lines above ground ◆◆◆</li></ul>			

**R&D Group**  
**TABLE 2-4. IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES**

	REQUIREMENTS	R&D PRODUCES ELEMENTS AND SPECIFICATIONS	CRITICAL ITEMS AND/OR STEPS (MAKE OR BREAK)	WHO LEADS? COLLABORATIONS	TIME/\$
<b>DEVELOP LASER TECHNOLOGY TO LEAK SURVEY LINES ABOVE GROUND</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Repeatable, reliable, accurate results</li> <li>• Minimal maintenance requirements</li> <li>• Aerial and hand-held versions</li> <li>• Not more than 2 man operations</li> <li>• Based on other applications if possible</li> <li>• Easy calibration</li> <li>• Methane ethane specific</li> <li>• Has search mode and pinpoint mode</li> <li>• Provide real time data to remote source</li> <li>• Performance equal to/or better than current technology</li> <li>• Increase productivity</li> <li>• Easy, fast setup</li> <li>• Valid in windy conditions</li> <li>• Use by PL operations field staff</li> <li>• Available 24/7</li> <li>• Equivalent sensitivity to existing equipment</li> <li>• East to use/minimal training</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Eye safe</li> <li>• Lightweight less than 5 pounds</li> <li>• All weather operation <math>-40^{\circ}\text{F} &lt; T &lt; 120^{\circ}\text{F}</math></li> <li>• Range <math>&gt;300'</math></li> <li>• Multi-sensitive <math>&lt;10</math> ppm to UEL</li> <li>• Explosion proof intrinsically safe</li> <li>• Weighs not more than 5 pounds</li> <li>• At least 8 hours operation on one charge</li> <li>• Field cal. by non-techs</li> <li>• Non-interfering with other instruments</li> <li>• Use at up to patrol aircraft speeds</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Self calibration</li> <li>• Review existing R&amp;D and either support or drop projects depending on success potential</li> <li>• Keep end-users involved throughout process</li> <li>• Adaptable for hand held and aerial use</li> <li>• Determine minimum power requirements to evaluate safety vs. practicality</li> <li>• Portable and mobile capability</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Leaders <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– R&amp;D organizations experienced in laser applications</li> <li>– National lab</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Collaborators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Industry <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Field tests, technical direction, priority/reevaluation</li> </ul> </li> <li>– States and DOT needs to be involved and aware</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• R&amp;D 2-3 years</li> <li>• \$9M</li> </ul>

**R&D Group**  
**TABLE 2-4. IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES (CON'T)**

	REQUIREMENTS	R&D PRODUCES ELEMENTS AND SPECIFICATIONS	CRITICAL ITEMS AND/OR STEPS (MAKE OR BREAK)	WHO LEADS? COLLABORATIONS	TIME/\$
<b>COMBINE GOVERNMENT AND INDUSTRIAL R&amp;D EFFORTS/MANAGEMENT</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Broad forums and focused groups</li> <li>Bring together same people every time</li> <li>Frequent meetings several times a year</li> <li>Decrease environmental Impacts</li> <li>Share in the funding of priority R&amp;D</li> <li>Decrease cost</li> <li>Review schedule</li> <li>Not Ad Hoc</li> <li>Maximize benefit of limited resources</li> <li>More efficient use of resources</li> <li>Co-ordinate defining R&amp;D top needs</li> <li>Coordinate in the information distribution and tech transfer</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Form research advisory group</li> <li>Form project advisory group that reports to the research group</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inform everyone of work establish a common one page summary for projects</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Leaders <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>OPS, DOE, regions and states, municipalities, industry-increase level</li> </ul> </li> <li>Research advisory (dozen or less) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>AGA, APAGA, NGA, DOT, DOE, NARUC, PRCI</li> <li>Individual utilities viewed as R&amp;D industry leaders</li> <li>Use organizations to select actual players</li> <li>Co-funders to some extent</li> </ul> </li> <li>Multiple project advisory (segregated by category of research) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Techies</li> <li>Use organizations to select actual players</li> <li>Co-funders to some extent</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>?????</li> </ul>
<b>ADVANCED ROBOTIC TECHNOLOGY FOR NON PIGGABLE MAINS (TRANSMISSION)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Not interfere with operations</li> <li>Maneuver through all obstacles in pipeline</li> <li>Easy to launch</li> <li>Vehicle capable of multiple sensor technology</li> <li>Accurate locating of defects</li> <li>Does not miss significant anomalies</li> <li>Meet DOT requirements for inspections</li> <li>Competitive with other pigging technology</li> <li>Repeatable reliable and accurate results</li> <li>Detect corrosion and/or evaluate dents and gouges</li> <li>Provide digital data</li> <li>Can be left in pipeline – long term</li> <li>Compatible with current pigging technologies</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Powered – Bi-directional</li> <li>Self powered</li> <li>Sensitive to critical defect sizes</li> <li>Travel meters to miles</li> <li>Use in live gas mains</li> <li>Go through as small as 4-inch pipe</li> <li>Real time results wireless communication</li> <li>Good for up to several miles</li> <li>Clear odd-shaped valve openings</li> <li>Self-diagnostics</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Critical step – determine type of sensors</li> <li>Operate in fluid filled lines</li> <li>Cost-effective</li> <li>Vehicle technology</li> <li>Regulatory acceptance</li> <li>Locate non-piggable lines for “real world” testing</li> <li>Is the needed sensor technology available?</li> <li>High reliability</li> <li>Optical capability</li> <li>Start with sensor or vehicle?</li> <li>Develop specs for test pipeline <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Valve types</li> <li>Slopes</li> <li>Moisture</li> </ul> </li> <li>Self propelled</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lead <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LDC's, industry, end-users</li> </ul> </li> <li>Collaborators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Vendors</li> <li>R&amp;D organizations with robotic and pipe inspection</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3-5 years</li> <li>\$7-10M</li> </ul>

**R&D Group**  
**TABLE 2-4. IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES (CON'T)**

	REQUIREMENTS	R&D PRODUCTS ELEMENT'S AND SPECS	CRITICAL ITEMS AND/OR STEPS (MAKE OR BREAK)	WHO LEADS? COLLABORATIONS	TIME/\$
<b>SYNERGIES – COMPRESSOR TECHNOLOGIES, DELIVERABILITY, RELIABILITY, EFFICIENCY, EMISSIONS</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• EXISTING EQUIPMENT</li> <li>• NEW NOVEL TECH.</li> <li>• MONITORING CONTROLS</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Increase rangeability on existing equipment</li> <li>• Use waste heat to cool intercoolers (absorption)</li> <li>• Provide improvements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Efficiency</li> <li>– Emissions</li> <li>– Reliability</li> <li>– Deliverability</li> </ul> </li> <li>• New noel techniques <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Inline compression</li> <li>– Variable stake re-cops</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Can operate over a wide range of flows</li> <li>• Fit within current physical envelope</li> <li>• High efficiency</li> <li>• Meet anticipated environmental requirements</li> <li>• Integrate engine/compression controls</li> <li>• Can operate over a wide range of pressures</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Smaller and portable</li> <li>• Reduce NO<sub>x</sub> etc emissions</li> <li>• No cast metal</li> <li>• Increase valve of blade life</li> <li>• Use less fuel than existing equipment</li> <li>• Use engine waste heat to create new species fuel to intake manifold reduce emissions, increase efficiency – coil reformer CH<sub>4</sub> + H<sub>2</sub>O → CO+3H<sub>2</sub> (new species)</li> <li>• Handle off-spec gas</li> <li>• Improved security</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Involve control and compressor manufacturers</li> <li>• Acceptance and field testing of novel designs</li> <li>• Market size/costs</li> <li>• Securing initial investment</li> <li>• Generating and approval of new industry standards</li> <li>• Intellectual property (Patent) issues</li> <li>• Determine HP market priority, i.e., size of unit</li> <li>• Target market potential in horsepower</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lead <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– End users</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Collaborators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Compressor manufacturers</li> <li>– Instrumentation control manufacturers</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 3-10 years</li> <li>• \$1-100M</li> </ul>

---

---

SECTION **3.0**

**INTERDEPENDENCIES, MODELING AND  
INTEGRATION**

---

---

**Participants:  
Interdependencies Modeling  
and Integration**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>ORGANIZATION</b>
John Bayko	Ontario
Terry Boss	INGAA
Bruce Campbell	GTE
Robert Cupina	FERC
David Damon	Dominion
Gary L. Forman	NISOURCE
Christopher Freitas	DOE/FE
Tom Hancock	TVA
Rondle Harp	DOE/NETL
Walter Kasperczyk	National Fuel Gas
Thomas Kraft	Wisconsin Gas
Shari Dunn-Norman	University of MO
Tony Savino	Keyspan
Nancy Shultz	Williams
Al Yost	

**FACILITATOR:** KEVIN MOORE, ENERGETICS, INCORPORATED



**Interdependencies, Modeling and Integration**  
**TABLE 3-1. WHAT ARE THE TECHNOLOGY ISSUES AND BARRIERS?**

◆ = TOP PRIORITY

● PHYSICAL PLANT: MONITORING AND LIMITATIONS	● OUTSIDE FORCE DAMAGE (INCLUDES 3 <sup>RD</sup> PARTY)	● DATA ACQUISITION AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY	● REGULATORY AND INSTITUTIONAL	● CONSTRUCTION, MAINTENANCE, AND REPAIR
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Material limits on T&amp;D</li> <li>• Monitoring of physical plant condition</li> <li>• Inadequate tools to evaluate pipeline integrity ◆◆</li> <li>* Intelligent system needed ◆◆◆◆</li> <li>* Tools to access operation and maintenance with risk factors ◆</li> <li>* Real-time vs. discrete continuous measurement</li> <li>* Control system to deliver off-peak</li> <li>• Need better pipeline inspection tools – internal and external</li> <li>• Lack of predictive pipe-failure models</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Warning of 3<sup>rd</sup> party intrusion ◆◆◆◆◆</li> <li>• Real-time damage detection ◆◆</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Converting data → real-time tools</li> <li>• Lack of sensors for dynamic applications</li> <li>• Lack of automated information data management</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Limitations on operating pressures</li> <li>• Common basis for tech. evaluation and certification</li> <li>• Permitting process</li> <li>• Limited dollars for tech. improvement</li> <li>* Maintain competition with protection of infrastructure ◆</li> <li>* Who pays for redundant capacity</li> <li>* Ability to adopt new technology</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Need low -cost pipeline rehab/retrofit technology ◆</li> <li>• Better guided boring technologies</li> <li>• Ability to excavate quickly without damage to underground utilities</li> <li>• Lack of intelligent trenchless technology</li> <li>* Tools to determine requirements for maintenance and new systems</li> <li>* Repair or replace plastic pipe ◆◆</li> <li>* Landowner concerns → non-intrusive infrastructure ◆◆◆</li> </ul>

*LONG-TERM STRATEGIES AND CAPABILITIES	*SECURITY AND VULNERABILITY	*COLLABORATION INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL	SYSTEM MONITORING, ANALYSIS AND CONTROL	DETECTION: UNDERGROUND FACILITIES AND LEAKS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Loss of long-term focus and capabilities ◆◆</li> <li>* Need training and dissemination of knowledge</li> <li>* Deregulation and mergers lose capabilities and corporate R&amp;D ◆</li> <li>* Quarter to quarter vs. long-term strategic approach ◆</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Cyber and physical vulnerability ◆◆◆◆</li> <li>* Interdependencies: gas and electric systems ◆◆◆◆</li> <li>* Need cost effective tech for security ◆</li> <li>* Vulnerability with T&amp;D system interdependencies</li> <li>* Laid off worker sabotage</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Develop and better alliances between industry and government ◆◆</li> <li>* Crossover technologies: pool efforts to get links</li> <li>* Silo effect: compete and compliment</li> <li>* Understand impacts and benefits of tech.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lack of understanding of transient flow and impacts</li> <li>• Lack of real time consumption information</li> <li>• Systems to respond to variable delivery cycles</li> <li>* Prediction of failure ◆◆◆◆◆◆</li> <li>* Flexibility of system tie to economics with models etc. ◆◆◆◆</li> <li>* Lack of continuity of service after event ◆◆◆</li> <li>* Affordability of obtaining data</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lack of technology to locate and identify facilities</li> <li>• Rapid leak detection needed – remote, non-intrusive</li> <li>• Ability to locate non-metallic pipe</li> <li>* Inability to detect small volume leaks</li> </ul>

● = Topics identified in earlier roadmapping

\* = New topics

**Interdependencies, Modeling and Integration**  
**TABLE 3-2. WHAT ARE THE R&D OPPORTUNITIES TO MEET THE NEEDS?**  
 ◆ = TOP PRIORITY

* SECURITY	* ALTERNATIVE STORAGE	* CONSTRUCTION TECHNIQUES	* INTELLIGENT SYSTEMS	* ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS	● 3 <sup>RD</sup> PARTY DAMAGE
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop low cost motion detection, monitoring, sensors/systems ◆◆</li> <li>Develop security audit – probe – for company to test their protective systems</li> <li>(NSF) IGERT analogy</li> <li>Develop training system for simulated attack               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Attack “kit”</li> <li>“Cascade failures”</li> </ul> </li> <li>Set up a “fly trap” for would be attackers</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Transient surge designs</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Landowner buy in               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Co-locate gas, electrical, water in utility carriers</li> <li>Communicate benefits</li> <li>Replace existing pipe with higher capacity lines</li> <li>Improve construction techniques</li> <li>Low profile/impact ◆</li> </ul> </li> <li>Trenchless technology to enable installation of 36” pipe like fiber optic duct.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Take sensing to level of “skin” for intelligent pipelines → models? ◆◆◆◆</li> <li>Nationwide energy control systems to be an activated in an emergency               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Monitor flows</li> <li>Route around outage ◆◆◆</li> </ul> </li> <li>Remote detection systems to passively report flaws, equipment, intruders, etc. ◆◆</li> <li>Develop systems for:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Corrosion monitoring</li> <li>Leak detection</li> <li>Pressure</li> <li>Location</li> </ul> </li> <li>Develop long-term sensor/robotic detection and repair for distribution systems continuous</li> <li>Intelligent system               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3<sup>rd</sup> party intrusion</li> <li>Damage detection</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Construction – landowner needs               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Compressor noise</li> <li>Reduction of emissions</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop “smart” pipe wireless remote sensing devices for pipelines and excavating equipment ◆◆◆◆</li> <li>Detection and prevention of 3<sup>rd</sup> party damage ◆◆</li> <li>Cost effective methods to detect intrusion and provide security in remote locations</li> </ul>

● = In existing portfolio

\* = Not in or partially represented in existing portfolio

**Interdependencies, Modeling and Integration**  
**TABLE 3-2. WHAT ARE THE R&D OPPORTUNITIES TO MEET THE NEEDS? (CON'T)**  
 ♦ = TOP PRIORITY

REPAIR	MATERIALS	COMPRESSORS	LEAK DETECTION	BORING	AUTOMATION	MODELING	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lower the cost of the in-the pipe technologies using new designs               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Launching equipment</li> <li>Internal repair methods</li> </ul> </li> <li>Extending service life of existing infrastructure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop protective/heal ing materials for exposed pipe</li> <li>Expandable metals</li> <li>Material science for HP lines</li> <li>Materials               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Small diameter</li> <li>High pressure</li> <li>Ease of installation</li> <li>Corrosion resistant</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Flexible compressor design for quick start-up and load following</li> <li>Second (next) generation compressors 2,500 PSI</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop remote methane monitoring and sensing equipment for use in excavations for personal safety</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Obstacle detection for HDD that produces 3-D imaging for all underground structures</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop low cost standard comm.. equipment               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Plug &amp; play sensors and activators</li> </ul> </li> <li>Develop redundant and separate controls for lines and communication</li> <li>Develop handheld devices and software for field data capture to eliminate field paperwork</li> <li>Develop communication system to share information on status of gas transmission/supply</li> <li>Develop national clearing house for system capacity information</li> <li>Model gas delivery systems and develop "alternate path" strategies (dynamic delivery system)</li> <li>Improve redundancy in transmission of gas (dynamic modeling)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop information exchange protocols</li> <li>Forecasting system of generation and LDC dispatching</li> <li>Continuity of service – Post event recovery               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Self healing pipe</li> <li>Redundant pipe</li> <li>Protocol for supplementing deliveries:                   <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Who's gas?</li> <li>Who pays?</li> <li>Who decides?</li> <li>Standardized categories and alerts/ responses</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>Define impacts of distributed generation on gas delivery</li> <li>Forecasting system for gas system based on electric dispatch and LDC</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Modeling to identify worst contingencies (gas) and how it would affect entire energy infrastructure</li> <li>Failure prediction utilizing non-invasive tools and models</li> <li>Tools to repair/replace               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Decision tree</li> <li>Cost/benefit</li> </ul> </li> <li>Real-time flow models that can activate operational adjustments to large swings in load</li> <li>Define/model "impact weighted capacity"</li> <li>Develop better sensor/models to continuously track and predict corrosion</li> <li>Relation between corporate optimization and global optimization</li> <li>Provide capture mechanism for pipeline failure data → model if possible?</li> <li>Risk analysis: Economic vs. actual life cycle</li> </ul>

**Interdependences**  
**Table 3-3. IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES**

TOPIC	REQUIREMENTS/ CHARACTERISTICS	R&D PRODUCTS	CRITICAL ITEMS AND/OR STEPS (MAKE OR BREAK)	WHO LEADS? COLLABORATIONS	SCHEDULE AND DOLLARS
<b>DEVELOP IMPROVED MATERIALS FOR HIGH-PRESSURE LINES</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2500 PSI Thinner wall pipelines</li> <li>• Small diameter plastic 100 PSI</li> <li>• Non-corrosive 500-600 PSI for distribution systems               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Easy install</li> <li>– Multi-fittings</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Retrofit existing systems</li> <li>• Integrate with smart pipe with a brain that talks to you</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Impact on installation, e.g., joints</li> <li>• Cost of pipe equals of cost of materials; thinner matters</li> <li>• There are things-on-the ground now, but cost reality is critical</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Safety and regulatory issues retro and new</li> </ul>	
<b>ENERGY ASSURANCE: DEVELOP TOOLS TO FORECASTING/ INTEGRATE CURRENT AND NEW CUSTOMER DEMAND (TO GUIDE SYSTEM DEVELOPMENT/PERF)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Integrated gas control (across individual companies and systems)</li> <li>• Example requirement: a 1 MW peaker on line in 15 minutes</li> <li>• System inc. storage</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Real-time assessment and modeling</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• New load characteristics</li> <li>• Potential for large, rapid swings</li> <li>• Load-change stresses on pipe/equipment</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• DOE lead: details to follow</li> <li>• Industry leads operational aspects</li> <li>• NERC</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Note: activities already underway in DOE; do not duplicate</li> </ul>
<b>DEVELOP LOW-COST IN-THE-PIPE TECH. NEW DESIGNS FOR LAUNCHING AND REPAIR</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Smaller excavation</li> <li>• Standard configurations</li> <li>• Top-entry launch</li> <li>• Live gas operations</li> <li>• Flexibility for any tool 6-24"</li> <li>• Applications               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Clamp repairs</li> <li>– Joining</li> <li>– Inspection</li> <li>– Cleaning</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Launch system with universal application</li> <li>• Cost-effective and easy to use</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Define market opportunity in gas systems to robotics industry</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Industry university capabilities in "robotics"</li> <li>• Industry crossovers, e.g., nuclear</li> </ul>	
<b>TAKE/DEVELOP INTELLIGENT SYSTEMS TO LEVEL OF "SKIN"</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Continuing sensing along system/pipe</li> <li>• Standardization: "Plug &amp; Play"</li> <li>• Data Acq/trans/use               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– All through system</li> <li>– Multiple end-point</li> <li>– Entirely new sensing targets, e.g., no current/ developing analogues</li> </ul> </li> <li>• For application to:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Intrusion Det.</li> <li>– Damage</li> <li>– Degradation</li> <li>– Leak</li> <li>– Failure</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Components               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Sensors</li> <li>– Algorithms</li> <li>– Actuators</li> <li>– Feedback system</li> <li>– Data/information protocols</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Nothing without integration</li> <li>• Screen existing/ developmental efforts</li> <li>• Application – specific refinements for these applications</li> <li>• Worry first about               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– 3<sup>rd</sup> party:                   <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>— on equipment</li> <li>— other ways to do it</li> </ul> </li> <li>– Failure/leak</li> <li>– Predictive failure</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Intersection with ANSI 12.19</li> <li>• Intersection with ASTM</li> <li>• State PUCs</li> <li>• FERC</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Near: sensors on equipment and implementation in active projects</li> <li>• Mid: inclusion into planned projects</li> <li>• Long: application on a system-wide basis</li> </ul>

**Interdependences**  
**Table 3-3. IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES (CON'T)**

TOPIC	REQUIREMENTS/ CHARACTERISTICS	R&D PRODUCTS	CRITICAL ITEMS AND/OR STEPS (MAKE OR BREAK)	WHO LEADS? COLLABORATIONS	SCHEDULE AND DOLLARS
<b>DEVELOP LOW-COST DETECTION (MOTION AND OTHER) AND MONITORING SENSORS/ SYSTEMS</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Key nodes/vulnerability: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Compressors</li> <li>– LNG facilities LPP</li> <li>– High-volume PTS</li> <li>– Pipeline hubs</li> <li>– Interconnects</li> <li>– Low cost <u>means</u> low cost</li> <li>– Nodal assessment</li> <li>– Mobility</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Low -cost tools/methods for zonation/by-pass</li> <li>• Standard product (so many points) to cover; need standard engineering specifications</li> <li>• As costs go down: Satellite-based approaches and others</li> <li>• Blast-resistant materials – but costs?</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Know what is available; what it costs</li> <li>• Tech approach must augment/replace guns/guard and show low cost</li> <li>• </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Industry: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Capability-specific</li> <li>– Driven by states and others</li> <li>– Regulatory push</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Coordination: INGAA and other (objective of shared recovery)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Now if not sooner</li> </ul>